New insight into crystal chemistry of topaz: A multi-methodological study

G. DIEGO GATTA,1,* F. NESTOLA,2,3 G.D. BROMILEY,4 AND A. LOOSE5

1 Dipartimento di Scienze della Terra, Università degli Studi di Milano, Via Botticelli 23, I-20133 Milano, Italy
2 Bayerisches Geoinstitut, Universität Bayreuth, Universitätstrasse 30, D-95447 Bayreuth, Germany
3 Dipartimento di Mineralogia e Petrologia, Università degli Studi di Padova, Corso Garibaldi 37, I-35137 Padova, Italy
4 Department of Earth Sciences, Cambridge University, Downing Street, Cambridge CB2 3EQ, U.K.
5 Forschungszentrum Jülich, D-52425 Jülich, Germany

ABSTRACT

The crystal chemistry of a natural topaz [with OH/(OH + F) < 0.5] was reinvestigated by means of laser ablation inductively coupled plasma mass spectroscopy, single-crystal X-ray diffraction (at 298 K) and neutron diffraction (at 298 and 10 K), and polarized infrared spectroscopy to define unambiguously the real symmetry of topaz, the location of the proton and its thermal displacement parameters at room and low temperatures, the hydrogen-bonding and the vibration modes (stretching and bending) of the OH dipole. X-ray and neutron structural refinements allow us to infer that the crystal structure of natural topaz with OH/(OH + F) < 0.5 can be described with the Pbnm space group. Violating reflections, found in the previous investigations and in this study, are likely due to Renninger effect (double diffraction phenomenon). The nuclear density Fourier map shows that the proton is located at Wyckoff 8d position and the refined coordinates are: x = 0.495(2), y = 0.252(1), z = 0.1629(7). The O-H bond lies on the (010)-plane and forms an angle of about 28.9° with the c-axis. Neutron structural refinements at 298 and 10 K show that the displacement ellipsoid of the proton is highly anisotropic. The H-bonding arrangement appears to be complex, with at least four potential H···O/F interactions (distances < 2.38 Å). The topological configuration of the O-H group described by the neutron structural refinements is confirmed by the infrared investigation: the OH stretching mode (at 3640 cm–1) has no component of vibration parallel to the b axis (i.e., the O-H direction is perpendicular to [010]). The OH bending mode (at 1161 cm–1) shows components along the three crystallographic axes, which appear to be more prominent along the a and b-axes. The possible distribution into the crystal structure of topaz of the minor/trace elements found (Na, Ca, Fe Cr, V, Ti, B), and the implied topological effects, is discussed.

Keywords: Topaz, crystal chemistry, plasma mass spectroscopy, X-ray and neutron diffraction, infrared spectroscopy

INTRODUCTION

Topaz [ideal formula Al2SiO4(F,OH)2] is one of the most important F/OH-bearing silicates, and is found as accessory mineral in F-rich granitic rocks (or in detrital sediments near areas of acid intrusive rocks) associated with pneumatolithic/hydrothermal events and in ultrahigh-pressure rocks (Pichavant and Manning 1984; Taylor 1992; Taylor and Fallick 1997; Zhang et al. 2002; Alberico et al. 2003). Topaz is a stable phase above 12 GPa and 1100 °C and could play an important role in water sequestration in deeply buried continental crust (Holland et al. 1996; Domanik 2003; Komatsu et al. 2003, 2005; Churakov and Wunder 2004; Zhang et al. 2002). By contrast, Northrup et al. (1994) described the structure of the synthetic Al2SiO4F2-Al2SiO4(OH)2 by means of optical microscopy, IR spectroscopy and X-ray diffraction (Rinne 1926; Isetti and Penco 1967; Ribbe and Rosenberg 1971; Akizuki et al. 1979; Ribbe 1982 and references therein; Barton 1982; Barton et al. 1982; Belokoneva et al. 1993; Northrup et al. 1994; Wunder et al. 1993, 1999; Shinoda and Aikawa 1997; Bradbury and Williams 2003; Komatsu et al. 2003, 2005; Churakov and Wunder 2004; Gatta et al. 2006a). For natural topaz, with OH/(OH + F) ≤ 0.5, the crystal structure was described in the Pbnm space group with one H-site (Fig. 1) (Alston and West 1928; Pauling 1928) and is associated with the F/O4 atom. The crystal chemistry and physical properties of topaz have been extensively investigated along the solid solution Al2SiO4F2-Al2SiO4(OH)2 by means of optical microscopy, IR spectroscopy and X-ray diffraction (Rinne 1926; Isetti and Penco 1967; Ribbe and Rosenberg 1971; Akizuki et al. 1979; Ribbe 1982 and references therein; Barton 1982; Barton et al. 1982; Belokoneva et al. 1993; Northrup et al. 1994; Wunder et al. 1993, 1999; Shinoda and Aikawa 1997; Bradbury and Williams 2003; Komatsu et al. 2003, 2005; Churakov and Wunder 2004; Gatta et al. 2006a). For natural topaz, with OH/(OH + F) ≤ 0.5, the crystal structure was described in the Pbnm space group with one H-site (Fig. 1) (Alston and West 1928; Pauling 1928; Ladell 1965; Ribbe and Gibbs 1971; Zemann et al. 1979; Parise et al. 1980; Alberico et al. 2003). Topaz is an ortho-silicate and its structure consists of chains of edge-sharing Al(O,F,OH)2-octahedra connected by isolated SiO4-tetrahedra (Fig. 1). The proton lies in a cavity adjacent to the Al(O,F,OH)2-octahedra (Fig. 1) and is associated with the F/O4 atom. The crystal chemistry and physical properties of topaz have been extensively investigated along the solid solution Al2SiO4F2-Al2SiO4(OH)2 by means of optical microscopy, IR spectroscopy and X-ray diffraction (Rinne 1926; Isetti and Penco 1967; Ribbe and Rosenberg 1971; Akizuki et al. 1979; Ribbe 1982 and references therein; Barton 1982; Barton et al. 1982; Belokoneva et al. 1993; Northrup et al. 1994; Wunder et al. 1993, 1999; Shinoda and Aikawa 1997; Bradbury and Williams 2003; Komatsu et al. 2003, 2005; Churakov and Wunder 2004; Gatta et al. 2006a). For natural topaz, with OH/(OH + F) ≤ 0.5, the crystal structure was described in the Pbnm space group with one H-site (Fig. 1) (Alston and West 1928; Pauling 1928; Ladell 1965; Ribbe and Gibbs 1971; Zemann et al. 1979; Alberico et al. 2003). By contrast, Northrup et al. (1994) described the structure of the synthetic Al2SiO4(OH)2 end-member [OH/(OH + F) = 1.0] in the Pbnm2 space group, with two non equivalent and partially occupied (50%) H sites. The reduction of the symmetry (with a loss of the mirror plane) was adopted because of the close proton-proton distance (about 1.5 Å, Northrup et al. 1994). On the basis of a neutron powder diffraction data, Chen et al. (2005) refined
the crystal structure of a fully deuterated topaz, Al$_2$SiO$_4$(OD)$_2$, in the $Pbnm$ space group, reporting that the Rietveld refinement did not converge in $Pnma$; two partially occupied deuteron sites (D1 and D2) have been found. However, even the crystal structure of natural topaz \( \text{OH}/(\text{OH} + \text{F}) \leq 0.5 \) has been the subject of debate concerning the topological configuration of the OH group and the real space group. On the basis of optical observations, and following the previous results of Rinne (1926), Akizuki et al. (1979) showed that natural topaz has pronounced sectoral textures. Sectors with general \( \{ hkl \} \) growth planes have been found to be optically triclinic, whereas \( \{ kkl \} \), \( \{ k0l \} \), and \( \{ h00 \} \) as optically monoclinic and \( \{ 100 \} \), \( \{ 010 \} \), and \( \{ 001 \} \) as optically orthorhombic. The authors suggested that the lower symmetry is due to the non-random substitution of OH and F in the structure. However, they found no appreciable differences in F content from sector to sector. In addition, after heating at 950 °C for 4 h, the sample appeared to become homogeneously orthorhombic (i.e., heating caused F/OH-disordering). Parise et al. (1980) investigated the crystal structure of natural Al$_2$SiO$_4$(F$_{1.82}$OH$_{0.18}$) topaz by means of single-crystal neutron diffraction. Based on violation of the reflection conditions, the authors stated that the symmetry of topaz deviates from orthorhombic, suggesting $P1$ as a possible space group. The structural data were not reported, only the H-site coordinates (derived from the difference Fourier map) in the $Pbnm$ and $P1$ space groups were given. Based on the observations of Azikuki et al. (1979), Parise heated the sample at 950 °C for 18 h, but the symmetry did not invert to orthorhombic (in Ribbe 1982). A single-crystal neutron diffraction study of a natural Al$_2$SiO$_4$(F$_{1.44}$OH$_{0.56}$) topaz was also performed by Zemann et al. (1979), who did not report any violation of the $Pbnm$ space group. In addition, the H-coordinates reported by Zemann et al. (1979) differ for more than 3σ from those reported by Parise et al. (1980).

On the basis of the potentiality of the current neutron facilities (Gatta et al. 2006b) and improvements in other analytical techniques, the aim of this work is to reinvestigate the crystal structure and crystal chemistry of a natural (OH,F)-topaz, with OH/(OH + F) < 0.5, by means of wavelength dispersive system electron microprobe analysis (WDS-EMPMA), laser ablation inductively coupled plasma mass spectroscopy (LA-ICP-MS), single-crystal X-ray and neutron diffraction, and polarized infrared (IR) spectroscopy to define unambiguously the real symmetry of topaz, the location of the proton(s), and its/their thermal displacement parameters at room and low temperatures, the hydrogen-bonding and the vibration modes (stretching and bending) of the OH dipole.

**EXPERIMENTAL METHODS**

A natural, pale yellow and transparent, gem-quality, prismatic single crystal (~3.2 cm$^3$) of pneumatolitic/hydrothermal topaz from Ouro Preto, Minas Gerais, Brazil, kindly provided by the Italian collector Stefano Putignano (Termoli, Italy), was used in this study. A preliminary check of the crystal in polarized light showed that it was free of defects. The crystal was then cut into several pieces, to perform the chemical analysis, the X-ray and neutron diffraction experiments, and the IR measurements.

One piece of the single crystal of the topaz sample (300 × 200 × 90 μm$^3$) was used for the WDS-EMPMA using a fully automated JEOL JXA 8200 microprobe at the Bayerisches Geoinstitut (BGI). Major and minor elements were determined at 15 kV accelerating voltage and 15 nA beam current, adopting a counting time of 20 seconds per element. To reduce loss of water and fluoride under electron bombardment, the crystal was mounted in epoxy resin and a defocused beam was used. The reference standards employed for the chemical analysis were: orthoclase (Si, TAP), spinel (Al, TAP), pericline (O, LDE1), and fluorite (F, LDE1). We measured the amount of oxygen to define the OH content. The final chemical formula (obtained by averaging 40 points analyses and on the basis of 2 μmol of Al) is Al$_{20.06}$Si$_{0.99}$OH$_{0.26}$F$_{1.74}$, which can be rewritten as Al$_{20.00}$Si$_{1.07}$O$_{4.00}$OH$_{0.26}$F$_{1.74}$.

Fine chemical analysis was performed on a second piece of the single crystal of topaz (400 × 300 × 110 μm$^3$) by means of LA-ICP-MS at the Earth Science Department, University of Perugia, Italy, with a laser ablation system made by New Wave UP213 (Nd:YAG laser source) coupled with ICP-MS Thermo Electron X7.

Calibration was performed using NIST SRM 612 as external calibrant in conjunction with internal standardization using $^{79}$Si, previously measured in WDS-EMPMA (Longerich et al. 1996). The data acquisition parameters (quadrupole settling time, dwell time, points per spectral peak) were optimized according to Longerich et al. (1996), and the protocol and data reduction algorithms suggested by Longerich et al. (1996) were adopted. The following masses (isotopes) have been analyzed: $^7$Li, $^{11}$B, $^{23}$Na, $^{24}$Mg, $^{39}$K, $^{44}$Ca, $^{45}$Sc, $^{47}$Ti, $^{51}$V, $^{52}$Cr, $^{56}$Fe, $^{71}$Ga and $^{133}$Cs. The final chemical composition is reported in Table 1.

Doubly polished sections of the topaz sample were prepared for examination of the OH stretching and bending modes using FTIR spectroscopy at the Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, U.K. To this end, two small single crystals were previously oriented using a Huber four-circle X-ray diffractometer at the BGI, and then cut and polished in thin platelets with the polished surfaces parallel to (100) and (010) respectively. Sections were prepared using Crystalbond (TM), and polished to thicknesses of 15 and 17 μm. Prior to IR examination, sections were soaked for 24 hours in high-purity acetone. Polarized mid-infrared spectra were obtained using a Bruker IFS-66V spectrometer with a Globar MIR source, KBr beamsplitter, an MCT detector, and a wire-strip polarizer. 512 spectra were obtained for each measurement, using a resolution of 2 cm–1. Samples were placed over a pin-hole aperture on a sample holder, orientation verified by optical microscopy, and the sample holder was then placed in the internal sample chamber of the spectrometer. The sample chamber was evacuated at high vacuum prior to obtaining spectra to prevent the appearance of anomalous absorption bands due to water vapor and CO$_2$. IR spectra were obtained from two sections using radiation polarized parallel to the $a$, $b$, and $c$ crystallographic axes of the topaz sample. The high water content present in the topaz sample presented problems with detector saturation. To overcome these problems, the sections were polished down to the minimum thickness required to remove them from the glass slides without fracturing. However, even at thicknesses down to 15 μm, some of the OH bands in the MIR spectra were still saturated. Final spectra were, however, of sufficient quality to allow comparison with previous investigations, and it was still possible to determine the anisotropy of the main OH bands.

A single crystal of topaz (160 × 110 × 20 μm), optically free of twinning and other defects, was used for the X-ray diffraction experiment. Accurate lattice constants were first measured with a Huber four-circle diffractometer (non-mono-
chromatized MoKα radiation) at the BGI using eight-position centering of 30 Bragg reflections (5° < 2θ < 40°), following the protocol reported by King and Finger (1979) and Angel et al. (2000). After the peak scanning and centering procedure, accurate unit-cell parameters were determined by vector-least-square refinement according to Ralph and Finger (1982) and Angel et al. (2000). The crystal was found to be metrically orthorhombic with a = 4.667(2) Å, b = 8.826(2) Å, and c = 8.378(2) Å. The unstrained cell constants deviated from the constrained values less than 1.5%. On the basis of the correlation equation between wt% of F (with 0 ≤ F = 100% (with 0 ≤ F = 100%) and the statistics of the discrete refined parameters, they were ascribed to Renninger effect (double diffraction phenomenon). Integrated intensity data (corrected for Lorentz-polarization effects) were then obtained using WinIntegr3.4 program (Angel 2003a, 2003b) and the absorption correction was performed following the protocol of Burnham (1966) using the SHELX-97 software (Sheldrick 1997) with anisotropic thermal displacement factors for the symmetry related reflections. No. refined parameters were Rn = 0.0269.

The last piece of the topaz single crystal (2 × 5 × 4 mm³) was used for the neutron diffraction experiments at 298 and 10 K with a Huber four-circle diffractometer (SV28/1) installed at the DIDO reactor—Forschungszentrum Juelich (FZJ), Germany. The single crystal was crystallized at the FZJ by slow cooling from 850°C to room temperature with a constant wavelength of 0.87238(1) Å was used for the room- and low-temperature neutron diffraction experiments at 298 and 10 K with a Huber four-circle diffractometer (Kappa-geometry, graphite-monochromated MoKα radiation) at the FZJ designed at the FZJ. A He-cryostat designed at the FZJ was used for the low-temperature measurements. Neutron diffraction experiments at 298 and 10 K respectively, belonging to the same classes of violating reflections were then collected at the BGI on an Xcalibur-Oxford Diffraction diffractometer (Kappa-geometry, graphite-monochromated MoKα radiation, point detector). Details concerning the data collection are summarized in Table 2. No restraints, in terms of the reflections conditions, were applied during the data collection. On 1455 collected reflections (maximum 2θ = 70.12°), 20 systematic absence violations of the Phnm space group, belonging to the classes 00l with (l = 2n + 1), odd (with k = 2n + 1) and odd, have been found. To define the nature of the violating reflections, we performed an azimuthal ω-scan for each of them. All the violating reflections were very sharp (with a FWHM 20% smaller than the other reflections) and vanished after an azimuthal rotation of only 1.5–2.5°. Therefore, they might be ascribed to Renninger effect (double diffraction phenomenon). Integrated intensity data (corrected for Lorentz-polarization effects) were then obtained using WinIntegr3.4 program (Angel 2003a, 2003b) and the absorption correction was performed following the protocol of Burnham (1966) using the ABSORB5.2 computer program (Angel 2002). After correction, the discrepancy factor for the symmetry related reflections was Rn = 0.0269.

The X-ray and neutron structural refinements

The X-ray diffraction data were first processed with the program E-STATISTICS, implemented in the WinGX package (Farrugia 1999). This program carries out a Wilson plot, calculates the normalized structure factors (E-values) and the statistics of the distributions of these E-values. The structure of topaz was found to be centrosymmetric at 92.6%. In addition, even the Sheldrick's I(Ue2) criterion (Sheldrick 1997) indicated that the structure is centrosymmetric (I(Ue2) = 11 = 0.988). Then, the diffraction data were processed with the program ASSIGN-SPACEGROUP (in WinGX, Farrugia 1999), which compares the equivalent reflections under all possible Laue symmetries, providing a valuable check on the supposed Laue symmetry. Two possible space groups (both belonging to the mmnm Laue class) were selected by the program: Phnn and Pbnm2. However, the Combined Figure of Merit (CFOM) showed unambiguously that the space group Phnn is highly likely (CFOM-Phnn = 0.729, CFOM-Pbnm2 = 9.178, the lower the value of CFOM, the more likely the assignment is correct; a value below 10.0 indicates a satisfactory fit, whereas a value below 1.0 indicates that the suggested space group is highly likely). The crystal structure refinement was then performed in the space group Phnn using the SHELEX-97 software (Sheldrick 1997) with anisotropic thermal displacement

### TABLE 1. Chemical composition of the topaz sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>wt%</th>
<th>Atoms per formula unit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Si</td>
<td>15.99(8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al</td>
<td>28.72(10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>17.66(12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O</td>
<td>36.24(13)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 2. Details of X-ray and neutron diffraction data collections and structural refinements of topaz

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Crystal size (mm²)</th>
<th>2θ range (°)</th>
<th>Scan type</th>
<th>Scan speed (°/s)</th>
<th>Time per step (s)</th>
<th>Neutron flux density</th>
<th>Scan width (°)</th>
<th>u, v, w range (°)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2θ = 2–70.12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>~2.5·10⁶ n·s⁻¹·cm⁻²</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>5, 5, 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:** Major elements were determined by WDS-EMPA and minor elements by LA-ICP-MS (Al₂O₃ wt% determined by WDS was used as internal standard for the LA-ICP-MS, see text). Standard deviations are in parentheses.
parameters and starting from the atomic coordinates of Alberico et al. (2003) without the H-position. Due to the low amount of the other elements present in the topaz sample (Table 1), only the (neutral) atomic scattering factors of Al, Si, and O have been used according to the International Tables for Crystallography C (Wilson and Prince 1999). At the end of the refinement, the final agreement index ($R_1$) was 0.0195 for 718 unique reflections with $F_o > 4\sigma(F_o)$ and 47 refined parameters (Table 2). No peak larger than ±0.36 e/Å$^3$ was present in the final difference Fourier map. Further details concerning the structural refinement are reported in Table 2. Observed and calculated structure factors are reported in Table 3.$^1$ Atomic positions, bond distances and other relevant structural parameters are summarized in Tables 4 and 5.

The neutron diffraction data collected at room and low $T$ were also processed with the aforementioned softwares of the WinGX suite. As for the X-ray diffraction data, the statistic criteria suggest that the structure is centrosymmetric with space group $Pbnm$ (Table 2). The structural refinement with the diffraction data collected at room temperature was performed in space group $Pbnm$ at first with isotropic displacement parameters using the SHELXL-97 package (Sheldrick 1997), starting with the atomic coordinates obtained from the X-ray structural refinement without the proton position. The neutron scattering lengths of Al, Si, and O from the International Tables for Crystallography C (Wilson and Prince 1999) were used. The secondary isotropic extinction effect was corrected according to Larson’s formalism (1970), as implemented in SHELXL-97 package (Sheldrick 1997), using a fixed weighting scheme $[1/\sigma(F_o)^2]$. When convergence was achieved, one intense negative residual peak ($–4.71$ fm$/\AA^3$) at about $x = 0.496, y = 0.251, z = 0.164$ was found in the final difference-Fourier map of the nuclear density (Fig. 2). A further refinement was then performed assigning the H scattering length to this residual peak. The final least-square cycles were conducted with anisotropic displacement parameters and all the principal mean square atomic displacement parameters were positive definite. The occupancy factor of the proton site was fixed as a function of the oxygen at the F/O$_4$-site (for the F/O$_4$ site, %O = 100 – %F). A further test was performed allowing the occupancy of the proton site to vary without any restraint: the difference in occupancy, with respect to restrained one, was less than 2$\sigma$. At the end of the refinement, no peak larger than ±0.84 fm$/\AA^3$ was found in the difference-Fourier map of the nuclear density and the final agreement index ($R_1$) was 0.0289 for 57 refined parameters and 892 unique reflections with $F_o > 4\sigma(F_o)$ (Table 2).

The neutron structural refinement based on the data collected at 10 K was conducted following the same protocol as the refinement at room $T$, using the refined site positions (including the H-site) at room $T$ as starting coordinates. The final agreement index ($R_1$) was 0.0391 for 600 unique reflections with $F_o > 4\sigma(F_o)$ and 57 refined parameters (Table 2). No peak larger than ±1.02 fm$/\AA^3$ was found in the final nuclear difference-Fourier map. Site positions, occupancy factors and displacement parameters relative to the neutron structural refinements at room and low $T$ are listed in Table 4. Bond distances and other relevant structural parameters are summarized in Tables 4 and 5. Observed and calculated structure factors are deposited (Table 3).$^1$

### Infrared spectra

Polarized mid-infrared spectra were collected over the region 5000–300 cm$^{-1}$ for examination of OH stretching and bending modes in the crystal structure of topaz. Four spectra were collected with the incident radiation polarized parallel to the crystallographic $a$ (E/$a$) and $c$ (E/$c$) axes using a thin section of the topaz crystal with the polished faces parallel to (010) and parallel to $b$ (E/$b$) and $c$ (E/$c$) using a thin section with the faces parallel to (100). Within the frequency range investigated, the E/$b$ polarized IR spectra show only one sharp absorption band at 1161 cm$^{-1}$ (Fig. 3). In contrast, the E/$a$ and E/$c$ polarized

---

$^1$ Deposit item AM-06-033, Table 3. Observed and calculated structure factors pertaining to the X-ray and neutron structural refinements of topaz. Deposit items are available two ways: For a paper copy contact the Business Office of the Mineralogical Society of America (see inside front cover of recent issue) for price information. For an electronic copy visit the MSA web site at http://www.minsocam.org, go to the American Mineralogist Contents, find the table of contents for the specific volume/issue wanted, and then click on the deposit link there.
IR spectra show two absorption bands at 3640 and 1161 cm\(^{-1}\), the first prominent for E/\(c\) and the second prominent for E/\(a\) (Fig. 3). Frequencies of these two absorption bands are in good agreement, and absorption band anisotropies are in excellent agreement with the IR data presented by Shinoda and Aikawa (1973). The single-crystal X-ray and neutron diffraction data collected for the F/O\(_4\) site (occupied by fluorine and oxygen) corresponds to the fluorine content (\(O_{0.\text{c.}} = 1 - F_{0.\text{c.}} = H_{0.\text{c.}}\)). For the X-ray structural refinement, the OH-stretching mode (at 3640 cm\(^{-1}\)), which has no components along vibration parallel to the three crystallographic axes (more prominent along \(a\) and \(b\) than along \(c\)), provides a clue for the motion of the OH-group and in particular on the anisotropic displacement of the proton, which will be discussed and compared with the neutron structural refinement finding.

The IR-investigation of this natural topaz shows that neither molecular H\(_2\)O nor CO\(_2\) are present in the structure, and that all hydrogen is present as OH– groups.

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**

The single-crystal X-ray and neutron diffraction data collected in this study allow us to infer that the crystal structure of natural topaz with OH/(OH + F) < 0.5 can be described with the P\(\text{b}nm\) space group. Reflections violating the \(P\text{b}nm\) symmetry, found in previous investigations and in this study, are likely due to Renninger effect (double diffraction phenomenon). Several recent studies have demonstrated that the probability of occurrence of geometric conditions for double diffraction is high. Concerning minerals, two interesting examples can be found regarding the real symmetry of pyrope (Rossmanith and Armbruster 1995) and stibnite (Sörensen and Lundegaard 2004).

The reason for the optical anomalies of natural topaz observed by Akizuki et al. (1979) is still unclear, but in recent years a high number of studies have shown that the optical properties of minerals might lead to a wrong determination of symmetry, because they are strongly influenced by tectonic stress, anomalous solid solutions series, incorporation of trace elements, and/or rough preparation methods of the thin sections (Libowitzky 1991, 1994).
the region between 4000–1000 cm–1, (above) with the incident radiation polarized parallel to the investigations, is given in Baur and Fisher (2003). An interesting critical review concerning the real symmetry of some minerals, erroneously assigned on the basis of optical references therein; Tanaka et al. 2002; Baur and Fisher 2003).


The site positions refined in this study by means of single-crystal X-ray and neutron diffraction are in good agreement with those reported by Zemann et al. (1979) for a natural Al2SiO4(F1.44OH0.56) topaz, with differences of <2 Å. The refined tetrahedral and octahedral bond distances and angles show quite regular polyhedra. Ribbe and Gibbs (1971) explained the small distortions of the polyhedra in the topaz structure with respect to ideal polyhedra in closest-packed structures in terms of simple electrostatic interactions. The F-amount of our sample refined on the basis of the neutron diffraction data (1.54–1.60 apfu, 14.6–15.2 wt% Table 4) appears to be slightly lower than that measured by means of WDS-EMPA [17.66(12) wt%, Table 1] and that determined by the correlation equation between F wt% and unit-cell constants [16.97(6) wt%, following Alberico et al. 2003]. The nuclear density Fourier map shows that the proton is located at the Wyckoff 8d position and the refined coordinates are: $x = 0.495(2)$, $y = 0.252(1)$, $z = 0.1629(7)$ (Table 4). The O-H bond lies on the (010)-plane and forms an angle of about 28.9° with the c-axis (Fig. 4). The neutron structural refinement shows that at room conditions the displacement ellipsoid of the proton is highly anisotropic (with the principal RMS-displacement parameters as 2.67:1.32:1). At 10 K this anisotropy slightly decreases (principal RMS-parameters as 2.24:1.42:1) and the $U_{eq}$ parameter is reduced by about 30%. The refined bond distances and angles between the proton site and the surrounding anions imply that at least four potential weak H···O/F interactions occur (i.e., H···O1, H···O2, H···O3, and H···F/O4, Fig. 5, Table 5), where one (i.e., H···O2) is slightly stronger than the others. The hydrogen-bonding observed at room $T$ is maintained at low $T$ (Table 5). The topological configuration of the proton described in this study for natural topaz with OH/(OH + F) ≤ 0.5 differs from that of the (synthetic) topazes with OH/(OH + F) > 0.5 (hereafter “topaz-OH”), where two non-equivalent and partially occupied H-sites are present and where the proton ordering might imply reduction of the symmetry to the Pbn21 space group (with a loss of the mirror plane), dictated by the proton-proton avoidance rule (Northrup et al. 1994; Chen et al. 2005). In fact, for the topaz-OH each of the two non-equivalent proton sites (i.e., H1 and H2) is characterized by an irregular trifurcated hydrogen-bond geometry [H1···O2, H1···O3, and H1···O4 with refined hydrogen-bond distances in the range 2.038(5)–2.281(6) Å; H2···O1, H2···O2, and H2···O4 with distances in the range 2.280(5)–2.524(5) Å, Chen et al. 2005], with the weaker bonds associated to H2. In this light, we can infer that the topological configuration of the proton site in natural topazes with OH/(OH + F) ≤ 0.5 appears to be an “average configuration” with respect to the H1 and H2 sites in topaz-OH. In fact, for the natural topaz of this study the refined hydrogen-bond distances lie in the range 2.216(5)–2.380(5) Å (Table 5) with four anions bonded. In other words, the “framework” of the crystal structure of topaz is maintained along the join Al2SiO4F2-Al2SiO4(OH)2 and only the topological configuration of the proton site/sites changes. Such structural re-arrangement is possible due to the presence of the aforementioned cavity, which allows the presence of two independent proton sites in topaz-OH without any drastic change in the framework. However, the different topological configuration of the proton site(s) in topaz structure implies different phase stability conditions. In fact, studies of natural and synthetic topaz appear to confirm that the stability of topaz-OH is restricted to very high-pressure/high-temperature conditions (Barton 1982; Wunder et al. 1993, 1999; Northrup et al. 1994; Schmidt et al. 1998; Zhang et al. 2002; Chen et al. 2005). In contrast, natural F-rich topaz [with OH/(OH + F) ≤ 0.5] can be found as accessory mineral in F-rich granitic rocks and associated with pneumatolitic/hydrothermal events.

The topological configuration of the OH-group described by the neutron structural refinements is confirmed by the IR investigation: the OH-stretching mode (at 3640 cm –1) has no component of vibration parallel to the b axis (Fig. 3), therefore the O-H direction is perpendicular to [010] (Fig. 4). The OH-bending mode (at 1161 cm –1) shows components along the three crystallographic axes, which appear to be more prominent along the a- and b-axes than along the c-axis (Fig. 3). The magnitude and orientation of the thermal displacement ellipsoid of the proton, based on the neutron structure refinements, supports the vibrational evidence because the major components of the three principal thermal ellipsoid coefficients along the crystallographic
additional OH stretching modes in the IR spectra. However, the broadening of the OH stretching band, or in the appearance of next-nearest-neighbor (NNN) effects, and would either result in expected to in of various cations into the octahedral site in topaz would be likely occupies in the tetrahedral site replacing Si. Substitution or Si in the octahedral/tetrahedral sites. B (~13 ppm, Table 1) ppm) has been found (Table 1), which might replace either Al framework con these alkaline and earth-alkaline cations would be located in in distorted polyhedra with CN > 6. Such local distortions can be accommodated because of the presence of cavities adjacent to the Al(O,F,OH)6-octahedra (where the protons lie). More likely, these alkaline and earth-alkaline cations would be located in the cavities substituting the protons, with a zeolite-like extra-framework configuration. In addition, a low amount of Ti (~56 ppm) has been found (Table 1), which might replace either Al or Si in the octahedral/tetrahedral sites. B (~13 ppm, Table 1) likely occupies in the tetrahedral site replacing Si. Substitution of various cations into the octahedral site in topaz would be expected to influence the OH stretching frequencies due to the next-nearest-neighbor (NNN) effects, and would either result in broadening of the OH stretching band, or in the appearance of additional OH stretching modes in the IR spectra. However, the concentration of additional elements in our sample is too small, and the amount of OH present too high, for any such effects to be noticeable.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

The authors thank M. Petrelli and G. Poli (Earth Science Department, Perugia) for the LA-ICP-MS analysis, M. Zhang (Cambridge) for help with IR measurements, and F. Seifert and T. Boffa Ballaran (BGI, Bayreuth) for helpful suggestions and encouragement. F. Nestola thanks the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation. The Editor and two reviewers are thanked for their useful suggestions.

**REFERENCES CITED**


